

EVALUATION OF ONLINE TUTORIAL LEARNING HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT COURSE

**Cherly Kemala Ulfa¹, Ari Juliana², Sarah Fadilla³, Didin Hikmah Perkasa⁴, Aulia
Keiko Hubbansyah⁵**

^{1, 2, 3}*Universitas Terbuka (INDONESIA)*

⁴*Universitas Dian Nusantara (INDONESIA)*

⁵*Universitas Pancasila (INDONESIA)*

Abstract

This study aims to evaluate the tutorial online learning program in the Human Resource Management course at the Universitas Terbuka. Research respondents or sources of information include the Head of Business Administration Study Program, Head of Management Study Program, External Tutors for Human Resource Management Courses, Lecturers who work at the head office as internal Tutors and students of Universitas Terbuka. This study uses a qualitative approach through the CIPP evaluation model (Context, Input, Process and Product). The data collected using interview techniques, observation and document reviews. The results of this study is the recommendations to the improvement of the Human Resource Management courses Tutorial Online Program and also feedback for Policy improvement of Online tutorial Programmes for Universitas Terbuka.

Keywords : Evaluation, Human Resource Management course, online tutorial.

1 INTRODUCTION

As a leader in online learning, Universitas Terbuka (UT) has disrupted universities in Indonesia, which generally teach face-to-face. UT has innovated with learning programs through online tutorials or what is called the UT e-learning system. One of the online tutorial lessons at UT at the Faculty of Economics in the management study program and the FHSIP Business Administration Study Program is the human resource management / HRM course. Some of the HRM materials taught in UT's online tutorial courses include:

(1) Basic Concepts of Human Resource Management (MSDM); (2) Global Human Capital and Competitive Advantage; (3) Legal Aspects in Human Resource Management;
(4) Job Analysis and Design; (5) Planning for Appointment and Termination of Employment (6) Compensation and Rewards; (7) Performance Assessment and Career Development; (8) Training and Development. The online tutorial learning process at the Universitas Terbuka is carried out in eight meetings. The meeting was divided into several forums, namely introductions, enrichment materials, and assignment forums, namely discussions, assignments and quizzes. The introductory forum is held at the beginning of the meeting as a forum for participants to get to know one another.

Then at each meeting there are learning materials in various forms such as word files, pdf or video. Furthermore, assignment forums include discussions and quizzes which are carried out at each meeting while assignments are carried out at meetings 3, 5 and 7. To see whether the materials taught in online learning will be able to achieve the learning objectives, an evaluation of online tutorial learning at the Universitas Terbuka is needed. In this case especially in human resource management courses. In the process of ongoing Online Tutorial activities, in general there are still some problems, such as less than optimal planning of learning programs, or implementation that is not fully consistent; the tutors' teaching preparation activities were not optimal; not yet optimal function of supervision, monitoring and evaluation as a component of quality control; so that the learning program has never been evaluated or the evaluation results per semester have not been socialized in a transparent manner. According to (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2011) several requirements must be met for the program to run effectively, namely: (a) the program is based on the needs or problems faced by the organization; (b) the program is based on the learning objectives or achievements by the participants; (c) the implementation schedule is well arranged; (d) the background of the participants is in accordance with the competency of the program to be carried out; (e) tutors have good qualifications and are competent in the field they are conducting; (f) the program is implemented in a comfortable place equipped with adequate supporting facilities; (g) the program uses methods and media that are relevant to the competence being carried out; the program is capable of facilitating participants to have the necessary competencies; the program must be able to satisfy program participants; and (j) the program needs to be evaluated on an ongoing basis. In order to obtain learning outcomes that are in accordance with the stated objectives, program objectives must be formulated based on needs, problems, assets, opportunities, paying attention to legal aspects, then a plan is made, implemented, and the results achieved again is used as input material for the next program. According to (Dessler, 2011) in the systematics of the learning process consists of 4 stages, namely: need analysis step, instructional step, implement the program step, and evaluation step. An almost the same opinion was put forward by Anthony, Kacmar and Perrewe (2010), that the learning process is divided into three stages, namely the assessment stage, the training stage, and the evaluation stage. Based on the opinions mentioned above, both of them begin with needs activities and end with an evaluation stage. Evaluation is useful as feedback from the entire process carried out evaluation, based on the definition put forward by (Bennett, 2003). It is generally assumed that evaluation is the application of research methods to elucidate a problem of action. looked at in this way, evaluation is not strikingly different from research. Evaluation is an extension of research, sharing its methods and methodology and

demanding similar skills and qualities from its practitioners. It is generally assumed that evaluation is the application of research methods to explain the action of a problem. It is seen in this way that evaluation is no different from research. Evaluation is an extension of research, sharing its methods and methodologies and demanding similar skills and qualities from practitioners. Furthermore, what is meant by program evaluation is related to the limitations of the program starting from the sequence of steps, procedures or actions that must be carried out systematically planning within a certain period of time to achieve a desired goal. In line with some of the meanings mentioned above, wirawan, stated that a program is an activity or activities designed to carry out policies and implemented for an unlimited time. The definition of program evaluation according to (stufflebeam, 2000) suggests the following: "program evaluation is the systematic assessment of a program or policy using absolute (merit-based) or relative (worth-based) criteria". The definition of program evaluation explains that program evaluation is a systematic process of assessing a program or policy based on absolute (merit-based) or relative (worth-based) criteria. In program evaluation, the CIPP evaluation model is known. According to (widoyoko, 2012) the CIPP evaluation model in implementation is more widely used by evaluators, this is because this evaluation model is more comprehensive when compared to other evaluation models. The concept of evaluating the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process Product) was first offered by (stufflebeam, 2000) as a result of its efforts to evaluate ESEA-9 (the elementary and secondary education act). CIPP stands for, context evaluation: evaluation of context; input evaluation: evaluation of input; process evaluation: evaluation of the process; product evaluation: evaluation of the results. The four abbreviations for CIPP are the components of the evaluation activities in this study.

2 METHODOLOGY

The approach used in this study is an evaluative qualitative approach with the CIPP evaluation model, namely a model that evaluates programs based on context, input, process and product or Context, Input, Process, and Product. This evaluation research belongs to the summative evaluative form, carried out externally, retrospectively, with the aim of evaluating an online tutorial learning program for the Human Resource Management course organized by the Universitas Terbuka. Evaluation research is useful for program managers where the results serve as a basis or reference in decision making and program accountability. The CIPP model is a process of describing, obtaining, and providing useful information for determining decision alternatives (the process of delineating, obtaining, and providing useful information for judging decision alternatives). With the CIPP evaluation model used in this study, it is hoped that more comprehensive and effective data will be obtained in describing and presenting information that is useful for assessing

alternative decisions. The respondents in this study were study program leaders, HRM tutors and students who were participants in the HRM class tutoring lessons. The data collection method is by conducting interviews, observation, and document review.

3 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In the evaluation stage of the background components of the program, describes a summary of data based on data collection, analysis of conformity with evaluation criteria, assessments and decisions as findings/results of evaluation research on two things, namely the program's vision and mission and program objectives. The data summarized from interviews with the Head of ADBI Study Program, Tutor and students are as follows.

3.1 Program Context Evaluation (Evaluation of Context)

Based on the results of the interviews that the main needs are the basis for the need to organize an online UT tutorial learning program because UT students are expected to be able to study independently. The independent learning method requires students to learn on their own initiative. Thus, the main requirement is the basis for the need to organize the UT online tutorial learning program to save time, because online tutorial learning can be done anywhere and anytime. So far the learning program has been appropriate. The development of HRM teaching materials refers to the HRM BMP (Basic Materials) ADBI4438. The entire BMP UT has gone through various review and editing processes which all refer to the goals, vision and mission of the institution.

The vision and mission of the online tutorial learning program refer to the vision and mission of the organization. Vision: To become a world-class open and long-distance university (PTTJJ), Mission:

- 1 provide access to world-quality higher education for all levels of society through the implementation of various PTTJJ programs to produce highly competitive graduates;
- 2 review and develop the PTTJJ system to support the implementation of the distance learning system in Indonesia; and
- 3 Utilizing and disseminating the results of scientific, institutional, and distance higher education studies to answer the challenges of national development needs.

The statement obtained from the HRM course tutor states that through the online HRM tutorial learning program, graduates will be produced. as well as to support the implementation of distance learning in Indonesia, as well as how UT responds to the challenges of national development needs

in educating the nation's children. The main requirement of this online tutorial learning program is to facilitate learning so that it can be reached by anyone without having to come to campus.

Based on a document study conducted by researchers, that the UT online tutorial learning program refers to UT's vision and mission. With this mission, UT is able to provide access to world-class higher education for all levels of society.

The formulation of the vision and mission describes the level of UT's ability to provide distance education, in addition to supporting the implementation of distance education and being able to respond to future challenges.

Based on interviews with informants, related to socialization activities regarding the vision and mission of the program, that the UT online tutorial learning program in the HRM course is a derivative of UT's vision and mission, where the online tutorial learning program according to the Head of the Business Administration Study Program has been socialized in writing to printed and virtual catalogs, besides that it can be accessed through the UT website which contains information about UT elearning

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and document studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded as follows: a) activities to socialize the vision and mission of the program to stakeholders have been carried out at leadership meetings, while special and specific socialization activities for each tutor have not yet been carried out, so it needs to be optimized.

ADBI's tutor risk analysis has been carried out and has been submitted to related parties, but it is quite difficult due to the limited number of human resources and the required human resource competencies need to be improved. There are 44 HRM classes for this semester, many aspects must be considered such as the implementation of the new system, the suitability of the tutor's competencies with the HRM courses, Making a master class that requires carefulness and accuracy so that there are no mistakes.

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and document studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded as follows: a) the program already has a written strategy formulation, contained in the online tutorial learning procedure (according to the criteria); b) strategy formulation in accordance with program objectives (according to criteria); c) the strategy is translated into three strategies, namely adding teachers, choosing participation and cooperation with other parties (according to the criteria);

and d) the formulation of the strategy can be operationalized (according to the criteria). Thus, the assessment is in the good category (100%), namely the formulation of the program strategy has partially complied with the criteria.

The document is SE WR 1 related to Learning Assistance Services, this is also explained in the UT catalog and UT website. Based on the results of an interview with the Head of the Business Administration Study Program, that an understanding of online learning can be found in the printed catalog and can also be accessed on the ut.ac.id web page, also open online services about elearning

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and document studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded as follows: a) the program already has a written design, namely following the applicable procedures (according to the criteria);

b) the design formulation is in accordance with the target program requirements (according to the criteria);

c) the program design has been described clearly and in detail into several stages of activity: needs analysis, staff training, improvement/fulfillment of competency standards, online tutorial learning program (according to criteria); and d) the program design can be operationalized (according to the criteria).

3.2 Program Input Evaluation (Input Evaluation)

Based on the results of interviews that the program has a clear curriculum, it is evaluated annually. Curriculum is a learning plan that needs to be provided as a reference for semester learning, which is compiled based on the following criteria: learning outcomes, materials to be taught and references to be used. Curriculum objectives are the goals to be achieved by each online tutorial learning program, which are related to the various abilities that have been formulated. According to the Head of the Study Program, stated that the UT Online Tutorial Learning Program implemented by the ADBI Study Program has a clear curriculum. According to the tuton who is in charge of the HRM course, in carrying out teaching in the HRMcourse, tuton is in charge of 8 meetings, the implementation of the tuton is 8 times of discussion and three tutorial assignments carried out at meetings 3, 5 and 7.

Based on data collection, it can be concluded as follows: a) the program already has a curriculum (according to the criteria); b) relevant according to program objectives (according to criteria); c) composed completely and in detail (according to the criteria); and d) the curriculum is still valid and can be operationalized (according to the criteria).

Based on interviews that the learning program plan is an elaboration of the curriculum, so it is compiled according to the program design used. Based on interviews with the Head of Study Program, stated that a

plan has been made which is carried out every semester. The tutors also conveyed the same thing that the program has a plan for online learning. This was conveyed by the study program to tutors via electronic mail, mail and group info.

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and document studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded as follows: a) a written teaching program plan already exists (according to the criteria); and b) the learning program plan can be operationalized (according to the criteria).

According to information from the head of study program, the learning program calendar is the timing of online tutorial learning activities in the semester period. Based on the document study, it is known that the Head of Study Program has prepared a tutorial learning calendar which contains important components and is explained in a clear and detailed manner, so that it becomes a guideline/reference in preparing the next program. This is reinforced by the explanation of the tutors that the learning program has a learning plan or calendar. This is conveyed in group info and can be accessed on the UT website.

Based on data collection, it can be concluded as follows: a) the training calendar is written in writing (according to the criteria); b) prepared before learning (according to the criteria); c) explained clearly and in detail (according to the criteria); and d) can be operationalized (according to the criteria).

Based on the document study, in the Procedure for Implementing the Online Tutorial Learning Program, it is stated that in order to achieve the program objectives as expected, one of the strategies is to get the number of participants according to the target. In order to get a good number of students as expected, it is necessary to stipulate provisions/requirements that are set to recruit prospective students.

3.3 Process Evaluation

Evaluation of process components, aims to determine the suitability of program implementation activities with the plans that have been made. In the evaluation stage of program implementation, describes a summary of data based on data collection, analysis of conformity with evaluation criteria, judgments and decisions as findings/results of evaluation of two things, namely the implementation of learning programs and learning activity activities.

For semester 2020.1 there are 38 classes, currently there are 44 classes. For HRM Tutors, old and experienced tutors are selected and master HRM content. Strived to be linear in the field of HRM. Internal tutors are only subject tutors, namely Ms. Irma and Cherly.

In general, the implementation of Tutor Tuton Performance at this time was quite good. The tutor's involvement is going well and the dynamic tutoring material is quite manageable by the HRM Tutor. Warek 1 and Warek 3, are the main stakeholders related to Tuton. Every Tuton season, there is always a new policy.

There are also some big problems that usually occur in the current tuton season. When the pandemic occurred, tuton became 100% of the learning outcomes assessment instrument at the Universitas Terbuka. UT always strives for innovation in tuton learning, even though in practice there are problems that must be addressed immediately such as the health condition of personnel, readiness for technological change, limited competence.

The curriculum, in this case the learning design, contains the goals to be achieved in the online tutorial learning program, so its implementation is guided by the curriculum/program design used in 2020.

The evaluation success criteria for indicators of the implementation of the learning curriculum are that there are actual activities for implementing the online learning curriculum carried out consistently in accordance with the learning program plan.

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and document studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded that the implementation of the online tutorial learning program curriculum is as follows: a) the online tutorial learning program curriculum is implemented consistently (according to the criteria); b) the framework of the main lesson is carried out consistently (according to the criteria).

The implementation of learning is intended to carry out learning processes/activities in a systematic, effective and efficient manner. Based on interviews with the Head of Study Program, it was stated that the implementation of learning was carried out twice a year.

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and observation studies compared with the existing evaluation criteria, it can be concluded that the implementation of learning, as follows: a) learning activities have been carried out (according to the criteria).

The learning calendar functions as a guideline for achieving effectiveness and efficiency in the learning process, by setting the time of learning activities within a certain period of time. Based on the results of the interviews, regarding the activities of implementing the Learning calendar, all informants stated that the learning calendar had been carried out consistently in accordance with the plans that had been made, and that all subject matter (types of activities; number of days and number of study hours) were carried out properly according to the plans made .

Based on data collection between the results of interviews and observation studies, it can be concluded that the implementation of the learning calendar is as follows: a) there are actual activities for implementing the learning calendar (according to the criteria); b) the learning calendar is implemented consistently, according to the learning program plan (according to the criteria).

3.4 Evaluation of Results

Evaluation of results or product evaluation is an evaluation carried out on the results or products that have been produced by the program. In essence, the product is the objective of the program. How the program initially determined the goals and objectives desired by the organization.

At this stage we can determine or provide recommendations for the implementation of a policy, whether this policy produces results that will continue to be developed or modified, or even discontinued. The aspects that are assessed related to the evaluation of results are the resulting performance, by looking at aspects: graduates.

The pandemic and implementation of the new system have prevented related parties, namely PBB / and UPP, from being able to provide proper training for tutors. At Fhisip there are 8000 classes, assisted by 1 IT person, this condition makes preparation for Tuton activities quite tiring. This tutorial is activities that take a long time to prepare, even throughout the year. Starting from making master classes, identifying tutors, class permission, guiding tutors to assess discussions, assignments, etc. Payment for tutors, a payment system that sometimes has errors. Submission of payment can be made by 2 Heads of Study Programs, in this case problems can occur when the payment has not been received by the Tuton. Complaints from tutors must also be handled. There is plagiarism detection software in the Tuton class, so that the tutor's work is lighter and students are also taught the values of honesty and integrity. The participation of internal lecturers in Study Programs is optimal, but study program lecturers outside the Faculty who are given additional assignments cannot be too involved.

In evaluating program results, describes the summary of data based on data collection, analysis of conformity with evaluation criteria, assessments and decisions as findings/evaluation results on two things, namely program achievement results, and side effects (side effects) of program achievements.

Based on the results of interviews with the Head of Study Program, it gives an overview of the learning outcomes in achieving student competence, namely: a) Pass score > 60 so that this aspect is in line with program objectives. Based on the study of documents on learning outcomes for aspects of mastery of knowledge are presented below:

4 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Universitas Terbuka's online learning is a strategic and superior program that needs to be continuously improved and updated regularly. Evaluation activities at every level is need to be designed periodically so that program effectiveness, quality and innovation are maintained in a sustainable manner.

4.1 Conclusion

4.1.1 Program Background Evaluation (Context Evaluation)

As for the basis for organizing learning programs because UT students are expected to be able to study independently. The independent learning method requires students to learn on their own initiative. Independent learning can be done alone or in groups, both in study groups and in tutorial groups. Thus, the main requirement is the basis for the need to organize/partner the UT online tutorial learning program to save time, because online tutorial learning can be done anywhere and anytime, besides that it's not easy to get tired because it can save energy. So far the learning program has been appropriate. The development of HRMteaching materials refers to the HRMBMP (Basic Materials) ADBI4438. The entire BMP UT has gone through various review and editing processes which all refer to the goals, vision and mission of the institution.

4.1.2 Evaluation of Input (Input)

Evaluation of Input (input) in the online tutorial learning program, received an assessment in the good category (100% fulfilled according to the criteria). In evaluating inputs in general, the formulation of learning strategies, program designs, learning program plans and preparation of program resources (HR, infrastructure and facilities, and budget) have been guided by the vision and mission and program objectives that have been set.

4.1.3 Process Evaluation

Implementation of learning programs and learning activities, with a good category (100% fulfill according to the criteria). The learning program is implemented according to plan, using the curriculum/program design.

4.1.4 Evaluation Results (Product Evaluation)

The results of learning outcomes in achieving student competence in online learning programs for HRM courses: a) Understanding of basic knowledge in HRM courses; b) increasing competence and knowledge of human resources; c) understanding in HRM processes. The average value of knowledge is > 60 so that this aspect is in accordance with the program objectives.

4.2 Recommendations

Based on the conclusions above, it is recommended for the Universitas Terbuka to improve the optimization of the Online Tutorial Learning Program for HRM Subjects through:

Based on an evaluation of the background, input, process and program results or products, it is recommended that UT implement the following improvement efforts:

- 1 Conduct socialization regarding the vision and mission in a more specific and sustainable manner, in line with Study Programs, Faculties and Universities.
- 2 It is recommended to reformulate program objectives based on more specific and concrete needs, related to the type of program.
- 3 Recommended to reformulate the program strategy by accommodating facilities, infrastructure/facilities and budget as one of the strategies in achieving program objectives.
- 4 It is recommended to compile and complete planning documents, including: 1) elaboration of the program, which is used as a guide for carrying out learning; 2) prepare a monitoring and evaluation plan, which will be used as a means of program quality control; 3) complete the administrative and student requirements documents, teaching staff and administrators
- 5 Improving the consistency of program implementation and consistency of budget support in accordance with the planned time schedule (on time);
- 6 It is recommended to increase the readiness of infrastructure and facilities, support program implementation.
- 7 Carry out monitoring and evaluation activities in a programmed and well-documented manner as a form of quality control and assurance activities in learning.
- 8 Based on the evaluation of program results, it is recommended that UT carry out continuous coaching and empowerment of students

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to express our gratitude and highest appreciation to PRI-LPPM Universitas Terbuka for funding this research and providing the opportunity to disseminate the results. We hope that the results of this research will be useful for the progress of the Universitas Terbuka in the future.

REFERENCES

- Donald L. Kirkpatrick dan James D. Kirkpatrick, *Evaluating Training Program: The Four Levels* (San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers Inc., 2005), h. 17.
- Bennett, J. (2003). *Evaluation methods in research*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Dessler, G. (2011). Human resource management 12th Edition. *Boston: Me Graw-Hill*. Kirkpatrick, D., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2011). *The Kirkpatrick four levels*. Kirkpatrick Partners. Stufflebeam, D. L. (2000). The CIPP model for evaluation. In *Evaluation models* (pp. 279–317). Springer.
- Widoyoko, E. P. (2012). Teknik penyusunan instrumen penelitian. *Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar*, 15(1), 1–22.

